



**DATE:** July 5, 2019  
**TO:** Mark Daniels, PE – Utilities Engineer  
**FROM:** Nathan Madenwald, PE – Capital Projects Engineer  
**SUBJECT:** WW0278 – Summit Valley Interceptor  
Young Contracting, LLC – Evaluation of Experience

## BID RESULTS

Bids for this project were opened on June 27, 2019, at 2:00 PM. Five contractors submitted bids as shown in the following table:

Bidder	Bid Amount
<i>Engineer's Estimate</i>	<i>\$582,099</i>
<b>Young Contracting LLC</b>	<b>\$524,760</b>
Matthews Trenching Co., Inc.	\$579,975
Krapff Reynolds	\$581,757
Jordan Contractors	\$609,595
Cimarron Construction Co	\$733,000

Young Contracting, LLC was the low bidder at \$524,760.

## PROJECT REQUIREMENTS

For this project, requirements for experience were specified within the Special Provisions. The following is the excerpt from the bidding Documents:

**1.2 EXPERIENCE:** The BIDDER shall have a minimum of five (5) years of experience in sanitary sewer construction, and shall have installed no less than 50,000 feet of sanitary sewer line. In addition, the BIDDER must have successfully completed, and must provide references for, at least three (3) projects of similar scope, with at least one contract greater than \$500,000, within the last 5 years.

## SUBMITTED EXPERIENCE

Young Contracting, LLC provided experience for completed projects as outlined in Attachment A and for on-going projects as outlined in Attachment B. The information submitted within the attachments did not meet the Project Requirements from the Special Provisions. As such, Young Contracting, LLC was contacted to request additional references to satisfy the experience requirements. Mike Young indicated (July 2, 2019, telephone conversation with Nathan Madenwald, PE) that Young Contracting, LLC could

not meet the \$500,000 sanitary sewer project requirement within the last five years but provided the following project references within the letter submitted on July 3, 2019:

Description of Project	SS quantities	Location of Project; Names and Contact Information	Date Project Completed	Contract Amount
Choctaw Nation Facilities/ Maintenance Bldg. (Also assisted with Wellness Center upon request) Watermain, San. Sewer, Storm, Lift Station/Subcontractor	Est 800' -- 8" up to 6' deep	Manhattan Construction/ Mark Weaver (918)878-3324/Choctaw Nation	10/1/2017	\$649,989.00
OU College of Medicine Academic Office Building Sanitary Sewer	Est. 300' -- 21" up to 22' deep Not a lot of footage but large pipe at deep footage	SE Corner of Stanton L Young & Childrens Avenue OKC: GC Manhattan Construction Co. Ryan McIntire (405)278-8897	8/31/2016	\$633,186.00
Eisenhower Middle School/ Site Utilities/ Sanitary Sewer	910' -- 8" 870' -- 6" up to 12' deep	Lawton Public Schools/CM Crossland Construction/Josh Jacox 405.748.5043	current project at 95% completion	\$413,830.00

Upon receipt of the projects, the *OU College of Medicine* project was confirmed with City of Oklahoma City to be for only **\$76,308** as shown per the maintenance bond information below.

**APPROVED**  
5-3-16  
As Per Requirements of  
Ordinance No. 5928  
FK

Oklahoma City Project # SD-2780

**MAINTENANCE BOND**

(Private Contract) #1012167

~~OK FOR~~ **KNOW ALL MEN BY THESE PRESENT:**

That We, Trade Mechanical Contractors, Inc., 136 NE 48th St., Oklahoma City, OK 73105, as Principal, and Mid-Continent Casualty Company, PO Box 1409, Tulsa OK 74101-1409, as Surety, are held and firmly bound unto THE CITY OF OKLAHOMA CITY in the full and just sum of \*\*\*\*\*Seventy Six Thousand Three Hundred Eight & 00/100\*\*\*\*\* Dollars (\$ 76,308.00), such sum being equal to the contract price for a period of two (2) year, for the payment of which, well and truly to be made, we, and each of us, bind ourselves, our heirs, executors, and assigns, themselves, and its successors and assigns, joint and severally, firmly by these presents.

Whereas, in a contract dated the 7<sup>th</sup> day of July, 20 14, with Young Contracting, LLC, the Principal agreed to construct improvements in the City of Oklahoma City, being: Sanitary Sewer OU College of Medicine

The first project provided is shown to be above the \$500,000 amount but other improvements were completed under that project amount – this does not satisfy the

\$500,000 requirement for a sanitary sewer project. Therefore, Young Contracting, LLC does not meet the Project Requirements for this project.

#### REFERENCES VERIFIED

While obtaining the additional project information, references were verified for four projects submitted. The following project references were verified and were generally positive:

NUMBER	PROJECT	OWNER	NAME	RESULT
1	WTP Improvements	City of Lindsey	Bill Myers, PE	Positive
2	Booster Station	City of Healdton	Bill Myers, PE	Positive
3	Drainage Project	City of OKC	Ed Degraffenreid	Positive
4	OU Medical	Manhattan	Ryan McIntire	Positive

In addition to the provided references, anecdotal experience was obtained regarding an emergency sewer project with City of Oklahoma City. The work performed on this project was not high quality and the project took longer than expected for an emergency project which requires an expedited project completion.

#### RECOMMENDATION

The Project Requirements included within this particular project were developed to ensure that the contract was awarded to a contractor who has regularly completed these types of projects. This practice has been commonly employed by the City of Norman and other municipalities.

Pursuant to the information provided by Young Contracting, LLC, this company cannot meet the experience requirements for the project. Therefore, though Young Contracting, LLC was the low bidder, Young Contracting, LLC is NOT the lowest responsible bidder as outlined within the requirements of the Competitive Bidding Act. **The award of contract to Matthews Trenching Inc. as the lowest responsible bidder is warranted.**

**ATTACHMENT A  
COMPLETED PROJECTS**

<b>Description of Project</b>	<b>Location of Project General Contractors / Owners Name &amp; Phone</b>	<b>Date Project Completed</b>	<b>Contract Amount</b>
OU College of Medicine Academic Office Building / Sanitary Sewer	SE Corner of Stanton L Young & Childrens Avenue OKC; GC Manhattan Construction Co. Ryan McIntire (405)278-8897	2/17/14	\$639,642.69
OSU Spears College of Business chilled water & paving	201 Business Bldg. Stillwater, OK; GC: Manhattan Construction Co. 2601 NW Expressway OKC (405)254-1050 Chad Kendrick;	6/1/15	\$1,944,810.96
Cordell Parking Lot Build Back/ Oklahoma State University/ Parking lot with underground utilities	OK State University/ Aubrey Wilson OSU Facilities Management 405.744.3988	8/16/18	\$1,252,466.00
Oklahoma State SE Campus Utility Extension/Chilled Water, electrical duct bank, etc.	OK State University/ Manhattan Construction Ryan McIntire 405.200.9196	5/31/18	\$3,832,200.00
City of Lindsay Water filtration system; plant, building, pumps	City of Lindsay Public Works Authority/ Myers Engineering 405.625.6911	7/20/17	\$1,085,000.00
Waurika Lake Waterline, paving, bridge repair	Waurika Lake Master Conservancy District Dave Taylor 580.430.8538	5/18/19	\$611,523.00
Putnam City West Baseball Field/ Site Utilities	Putnam City Schools/ Globe Construction Ken Murry 405.478.3502	8/30/18	\$478,984.00
Healdton Booster Pump Station	City of Healdton/ Myers Engineering Bill Myers 405.755.5325	3/31/2019	\$618,515.00



## ATTACHMENT B ON-GOING PROJECTS

Description of Project	Project Owner/Engineer/CM	Contract Amount	% Complete	Start Date	Anticipate Completion Date
Replacement of Sodium Hypochlorite Tanks	City of Lawton / Afsaneh Jabbar (580) 824-3410	\$284,537.00	15%	2/14/2018	Sep-19
Blackwell Tonkawa Airport	City of Blackwell Engineer - Toby Baker - CEC Corp. (405) 753-4200	\$233,900.00	25%	9/10/2018	Jun-19
Thomas Airport - Self Service Fuel System	City of Thomas Engineer - Toby Baker CEC Corporation (405) 753-4200	\$237,650.00	30%	9/10/2018	Jun-19
Eisenhower Middle School/ Utilities	Lawton Public Schools/CM Crossland Construction Josh Jacox 405.748.5043	\$355,000.00	95%	9/15/18	Jun-19
Heritage Trails/Oakridge Schools / Utilities	Moore Public Schools/CM Boldt Construction/ Gabriela Escalona 405.486.1245	\$221,250.00	35%	12/1/18	Jun-19
Alex Public Schools/Utilities	Alex Public Schools/ CM CMS Willowbrook/ Erik Williams 405.224.1554	\$355,800.00	98%	12/10/18	Jun-19
Mustang High School Performing Arts/Utilities	Mustang Public Schools/ CM Crossland Construction Austin Reid 405.478.5043	\$234,000.00	50%	1/15/19	Jul-19
Remington Park Town Center	Grandwoods Development Tom Parish	\$675,000.00	15%	2/1/19	Sep-19
City of OKC Drainage Project	City of OKC Engineering Inger Peters 405.297.2241	\$3,654,657.00	25%	2/28/19	May-20
NE 10th Streetscape	City of Oklahoma City/ Econ. Development Leana Dozier 405.604.6780	\$483,587.00	20%	4/1/19	Aug-19
Danforth Waterline Improvements	Edmond Public Works Authority/Ken Miner 405.359.4773	\$361,248.00	40%	5/1/19	Aug-19