



associated pavement was postponed without being heard from the February 12, 2018 Historic District Commission meeting to a Special Meeting on February 20, 2018 to allow proper notification for this request. The Historic Preservation Officer indicated that the front yard was not posted with a public hearing notice sign. Posting a public hearing notification sign in the front yard at least 7 days prior to the public hearing for a COA request is required by Historic District Ordinance.

**February 20, 2018** – This meeting was cancelled due to inclement weather; therefore the COA request mentioned above was not heard. There was not enough time to reschedule a special meeting; therefore it is being heard at the March 5, 2017 meeting.

**March 5, 2018-** A COA for the installation of a garage and associated pavement, a rear addition, and a covered rear porch were approved as submitted. The side yard fence was approved for 4qheight instead of 6qand the placement of the fence was modified slightly. The applicant was asked to return with alternative garage doors designs and materials for review and approval at a future meeting.

### **3. Project Description:**

At the March meeting the request for the garage was approved as submitted except for the garage doors. The Commissioners requested that the applicant return with a different garage door material and design. In particular, the Commissioners were interested in alternative materials to metal such as wood or Smartwood. The garage door request was to be heard at the April meeting, however, the applicant had a scheduling conflict and asked for garage door request to be moved this meeting.

The applicant is proposing steel door with Smartwood overlay. The door has two 6-lite windows located at the top of the door . The drawing of the proposed door is attached for the Commission review.

### **B. Analysis of Request:**

Staff would note that the Guidelines do not provide clear specific direction for doors either in a principal structure or accessory structures. However, guidance can be provided by looking at the sections of the Guidelines listed below.

#### **Historic District Guidelines:**

*1.4 Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation Both the Historic District Ordinance and the guidelines portion of the Norman Historic Preservation Handbook include The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (US Department of the Interior/National Park Service, Heritage Preservation Services, Revised 1990).*

- 1. Make Minimal Changes.** *A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*
- 2. Retain Historic Character.** *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historical materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 3. Avoid False Historical Impressions.** *Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.*
- 4. Acknowledge Changes Over Time.** *Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.*
- 5. Preserve Distinctive Features.** *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*
- 6. Repair Rather Than Replace.** *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacements of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*
- 7. Avoid Harsh Treatments.** *Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.*
- 8. Protect Archaeological Resources.** *Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.*
- 9. Make Compatible Additions.** *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
- 10. Preserve Original Integrity.** *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

### **2.3 Guidelines for Garages & Accessory Structures**

- .1 Preserve Accessory Structures.** *When possible, retain and preserve garages and accessory structures in their original locations and*

*configurations. Even if the function changes, the exterior appearance should remain the same.*

**.2 Preserve Original Materials.** *When possible, retain and preserve character-defining materials, features, and details of historic garages and accessory buildings, including foundations, siding, masonry, windows, garage doors, and architectural trim. When necessary, repair character-defining materials, features, and details of historic garages and accessory buildings according to pertinent guidelines.*

**.3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions.** *If replacement of a deteriorated element or detail of a historic garage or accessory building is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in kind rather than replacing the entire feature. Match the original in design, dimension, texture, and material. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original materials is not technically feasible.*

### 3.3 Guidelines for Masonry Features

**.2 Preserve Original Materials and Details.** *Retain and preserve historic masonry materials, such as brick, terra-cotta, limestone, granite, stucco, slate, concrete, cement block, and clay tile, and their distinctive construction features.*

### 3.5 Guidelines for Windows and Doors:

**.1 Retain Original Windows.** *Retain and preserve original windows, including glass, frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, and hardware.*

**.2 Retain Historic Glass.** *Retain original glass in historic windows if at all possible. Leaded glass windows shall be preserved. Bubbles and waves give old glass its distinctive look and add to the historic character of the house.*

**.3 Preserve Original Doors.** *Retain and preserve original doors and door surrounds including frames, glazing, panels, sidelights, fanlights, surrounds, thresholds, and hardware.*

**.4 Replace Only Deteriorated Features.** *If replacement of a deteriorated window or door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in kind rather than the entire unit. Broken sash cords, for example, can be repaired and do not necessitate replacing an entire window. Match the original in design, dimension, placement, and material.*

**.5 Replacement Doors.** *Replacement doors and door surrounds shall be appropriate to the style of the structure. Doors shall be relocated, enlarged, or introduced only when the alteration is appropriate to the style of the building.*

**.10 Preserve Original Openings.** *Do not create new openings in the front or side facades of historic structures. Do not enlarge or diminish existing openings to fit stock window and door sizes. If new openings are necessary to meet code requirements, they shall be compatible with*

*historic windows for that structure in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.*

*.12 Use Wood Windows in Primary Structures and Additions. For construction of new primary structures, choose windows that complement window types in surrounding structures in material, placement, size, shape, and design. While single-pane, true divided-light, wood frame windows are the most desirable choice for new construction in historic districts, double-pane glass wood windows with interior and exterior applied muntins and shadow bars between the panes are permitted. Aluminum cladding of wooden windows is permissible for use in construction of new primary structures and additions. Vinyl cladding of wood windows is not appropriate.*

#### **D. Analysis of Request:**

##### **Observations and Concerns**

- 1) The primary structure is a contributing structure to the Chautauqua Historic District.
- 2) The property is an interior lot facing Lahoma Avenue. This property has one front facade as defined by the Historic District Guidelines.
- 3) The front and side elevations of the primary structure are considered character defining elevations.
- 4) The proposed garage that was approved at last month's meeting is a 836 square foot stucco garage. .
- 5) The applicant had proposed two metal overhead garage doors at last month's meeting, the Commission requested that the applicant return with alternatives to metal since this material is not the typical material found in historic garages. Additionally, the Commission has not recently approved metal garage doors that are visible from the front public right-of-way. The garage doors will face the street and will be visible from the front public right-of-way, however, the proposed garage structure will setback a 100' from the front property line.

##### **Recommended Findings:**

1. While the garage is not attempting to restore the historic accessory structure that was located on this property, it still needs to be compatible with the historic principal structure and with the neighborhood. The Commission would need to determine if the Smartwood garage door submitted for review meets the Guideline and does not impact the historic structure or surrounding district.

**Commission Action:** Motion to approve or reject the Certificate of Appropriateness request for overhead garage doors for the property located at 540 S Lahoma Avenue with the specific findings as found in Section D and that the requested work complies with relevant Guidelines cited in Section C.