

STAFF REPORT

Item 1 of 2

Property Location: 434 Chautauqua
Chautauqua Historic District

Applicants: Krittenbrink Architecture LLC
On behalf of owners Kash and Nina Barker
434 Chautauqua

Request:

- Remove dormer peaks on front elevation
- Continue existing mansard roof with wood shingle siding on second floor in a single plane the full width of the house

Background: This contributing, two-story Craftsman/Bungalow-style structure was built around 1920. The exterior walls are a combination of weatherboard and wood shingle. The structure has a decorative concrete block foundation. The asphalt-shingle, side gambrel roof is cross-gabled. Wood windows are predominantly vertical, four-over-one, hung. The wood front door is glazed and paneled. The partial porch has been screened. Decorative details include sets of triple windows.

Guideline References: The *Historic Preservation Handbook* addresses the proposed changes in the following sections:

Section 1.4 Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation

4. Acknowledge Changes Over Time. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

Section 3.1 Guidelines for Exterior Walls

.1 Preserve Original Walls. Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.

.2 Retain Original Building Materials. Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.

STAFF REPORT

Section 3.2 Guidelines for Wood Features

.1 Preserve Original Features. Retain and preserve wood features that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including siding, shingles, cornices, brackets, pediments, columns, balustrades and architectural trim.

Section 3.4 Guidelines for Roofs

.1 Preserve Original Features. Retain and preserve roofs and roof features that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, such as cresting, dormers, cupolas, and cornices. Tile and slate roofs rarely need to be discarded.

.2 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions of Roof Features. If replacement of a deteriorated roof feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in kind to match the original feature in design, dimension, detail, and material. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible.

Section 3.6 Entrances, Porches and Balconies

.1 Preserve Original Entrances, Porches and Balconies. Retain and preserve entrances, porches and balconies that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including column, pilasters, piers, entablatures, sidelights, fanlights, transoms, steps, railings, floors and ceilings.

Staff Comment:

The applicants were granted a COA at the March 3, 2014 meeting to allow the removal of a two-story, non-original rear addition which will be replaced with a new rear addition in the same footprint; to rebuild a rear deck and staircase, and relocate existing windows on the north elevation in order to facilitate interior programming. Building permits are currently being reviewed to begin this work.

The application to modify the front porch was heard by the Commission on June 2, 2014, and approved. That allowed the removal of the half walls on all but the south side, removal of the screens, the addition of rails and balustrades, and allowed for alternatives to the area below the porch floor to be matching block, lattice, or retain existing siding.

STAFF REPORT

This application is to modify the front elevation of the house including the front wall of the second story. This is an area the owners believe has been altered from the house's original form and several of these modifications have resulted in deterioration related to poor drainage and have attracted critters. The owners seek to solve both drainage and wildlife issues in a manner that still preserves the major character-defining features of the front of the house.

Second Floor Front Wall

In its current form, the second floor of this structure has a gambrel roof form which is evident on the north and south elevations with a modified mansard roof form on the east elevation. The mansard is covered with wood shingles which continue around to the side gambrels. The mansard includes a pair of small gables with the same pitch as the gambrel over a pair of recessed, triple windows. According to investigation done by the applicants' architect, the gables are decorative and not structural, leading them to deduce that the gables were a later addition. The mansard slopes away from the windows draining onto the porch roof below.

Proposed Changes

The applicants propose to remove the two gables peaks on the east elevation, leaving the pair of triple windows intact. In addition they propose to remove the window recesses, creating a continuous mansard roof plane and allowing for more effective guttering and drainage. Deteriorated wood shingles will be replaced in kind.

Previous HDC Decision and City Council Action

The HDC reviewed this application for a COA on May 5, 2014 and denied it on the basis that there was no evidence submitted to lead the Commission to believe that the existing façade is not original; and furthermore, if not original, had gained significance over time in accord with the Secretary of Interior standards.

An appeal to the City Council was heard on June 24, 2014, and the City Council remanded the item back to the Commission for review based on new information provided by the applicant.